



Agenda item 10.1
Items for approval by the CIML

Agenda item 10.1.3.2
Amended periodic review procedure for OIML publications

Contents

- 1 Proposal
- 2 Recommendation for CIML approval

Annexes

- Annex A: Amended periodic review procedure – Detailed description
- Annex B: Proposed text for inclusion in B 6-1
- Annex C: Amended periodic review procedure - Flowchart



1 Proposal

1.1 Introduction

One of the topics discussed at the Task Group 2023 (TG 2023) meeting in March 2019 was improving the effectiveness of OIML technical work. This discussion was prompted by concerns that have been raised regarding the timescales to develop new or revised OIML publications, and the inconclusive outcomes of seven periodic reviews of OIML publications conducted in the fourth quarter of 2018, as well as those undertaken in an earlier pilot phase.

1.2 Prioritisation of publications

TG 2023 considered that high priority OIML publications should be identified so that OIML technical work can in turn be prioritised and make effective use of available resources. A set of criteria was established to identify priority publications as follows:

- 1) Recommendations with relevance to the OIML Certification System (OIML-CS) (e.g. number of certificates in the past).
- 2) Publications where “demand” is expected in the future, based on the
 - needs of Member States,
 - needs of society,
 - needs of manufacturers (e.g. demand for certificates), or the
 - needs of Countries or Economies with Emerging Metrology Systems (CEEMS).
- 3) Generic Documents that cover a wide range of instruments such as D 11 and D 31.
- 4) Publications with relevance to the Organisation e.g. B 6, D 30, R 111, Vocabularies.
- 5) Publications with relevance to Regional Legal Metrology Organisations (RLMOs), e.g. those used for normative documents in the EU.

TG 2023 also asked that Technical Committees (TCs), Subcommittees (SCs) and Project Groups (PGs) consider whether standards from other organisations already cover the legal metrology aspects of instruments, and that they consider what the OIML can add to those existing standards.

TG 2023 proposed that the Presidential Council (PC) and the BIML should monitor the criteria to ensure that they remain valid and continue to meet the objectives of the OIML.

TG 2023 also proposed that these criteria should be used to identify the “top-10” priority publications, with the “top-10” publications subject to a more frequent periodic review, e.g. every two years instead of every five years as currently specified in B 6-1:2017, 6.11, to ensure that they remain fit-for-purpose. If the periodic reviews of “top-10” publications identify a need to revise or update a publication, then



54 CIML Addendum 10.1.3.2

Version 1 - 2019-07-19

it is proposed that the BIML shall provide additional support to the Project Group conducting the revision or update.

1.3 Alternative periodic review process

TG 2023 developed an initial proposal for an alternative periodic review process to replace the current process defined in OIML B 6-1:2017, 6.11.

The alternative process is aimed at identifying publications that require a full technical *revision*, such as where significant changes are required to implement new or amended technical requirements, and publications that simply require an editorial or minor technical *update*, for example to address a new edition of a standard referenced in a test procedure. The amended periodic review process will therefore have four options (re-confirm, revise, update or withdraw), when compared to the three options in the current process (re-confirm, revise or withdraw).

TG 2023 identified that the OIML-CS Management Committee (MC) should play an active role in the process for publications that are of relevance to the OIML-CS.

In addition, TG 2023 considered that the periodic reviews would be more likely to produce a clear and conclusive outcome (i.e. re-confirm, revise, update or withdraw) if the reasons for a particular outcome are clearly identified as part of the periodic review process, e.g. where a technical revision of a Recommendation is required to account for a new technology.

TG 2023 also considered that the Presidential Council should play a part in the process, in terms of

- developing/reviewing the criteria to identify priority publications,
- identifying priority publications, in conjunction with the BIML, based on these criteria, and
- reviewing project proposals to ensure that they fulfil specified pre-conditions, e.g. convener identified, project plan/schedule, etc., prior to submission to the CIML for approval.

1.4 Presidential Council meeting – March 2019

The proposal from TG 2023 for an amended periodic review process was presented and discussed at the PC Meeting in March 2019. After consideration, the PC decided that a detailed proposal for an amended periodic review process, based on the initial proposal from TG 2023, should be developed by the BIML, with input from the OIML-CS MC, for submission to the CIML.

1.5 Role of the OIML-CS MC

TG 2023 identified that the OIML-CS MC should play an active part in the periodic review process for publications that are of interest to the OIML-CS. At the second OIML-CS MC meeting in March 2019, the proposal from TG 2023 and the PC was discussed, and the MC agreed that it should participate in an amended periodic review process for OIML Recommendations. In addition, it was suggested that the OIML-CS MC could feed into the prioritisation process by identifying Recommendations where



54 CIML Addendum 10.1.3.2

Version 1 - 2019-07-19

there is expected to be demand for inclusion in the OIML-CS or where a Recommendation is in need of revision.

1.6 Detailed proposal and flowchart

Annex A provides a detailed description of the proposal for an amended periodic review process. Annex B shows the new text, and Annex C the new flowchart, that would be included in a revised B 6-1 to implement the amended proposal.

2 Recommendation for CIML approval

It is recommended that the CIML approves the proposal for an amended periodic review process, as detailed in Annex A, with the replacement text in Annex B superseding the current process in OIML B 6-1:2017, 6.11, with immediate effect.

It is recommended that the CIML approves the proposal to add the explanatory flowchart in Annex C for the new review process to OIML B 6-1.



ANNEXES

Annex A: Amended periodic review procedure – Detailed description

A.1 Prioritisation criteria

The CIML President, with the advice of the Presidential Council and the BIML, shall monitor and update the criteria for the prioritisation of publications on an annual basis and propose the priorities to the CIML.

A.2 Identification of “top-10”

The BIML, in consultation with the PC and the OIML-CS Management Committee, shall identify the “top-10” publications. The identification of the “top-10” publications shall be monitored to ensure that they align with the priorities and objectives of the Organisation. The list shall be submitted to the CIML for approval.

A.3 Periodic review

Publications in the “top-10” shall undergo a periodic review every two years. Other publications shall undergo a periodic review every five years, as currently defined in OIML B 6-1:2017, 6.11.

The options for each periodic review of a publication are that it should be either

- 1) re-confirmed, in its current form,
- 2) revised,
- 3) updated, or
- 4) withdrawn.

Note 1: A publication shall be revised where a major modification of the publication is considered necessary to address a significant technical change, e.g. inclusion of a new measurement technique, software requirements, technological innovation, etc.

Note 2: A publication shall be updated where a minor modification of the publication is considered necessary to address editorial or minor technical changes, e.g. the reference to an international standard in a test procedure needs to be updated.

A.4 OIML-CS publications

For publications of relevance to the OIML-CS, the BIML shall consult with representatives of the OIML-CS MC on the selection of the preferred periodic review option. The appropriate TC or SC secretariat shall be involved in the consultation.

Based on the outcome of the consultation, the preferred option (either 1, 2, 3 or 4 from A.3) for periodic review shall be selected, with the reason(s) for selecting the preferred option identified. The MC



54 CIML Addendum 10.1.3.2

Version 1 - 2019-07-19

Members shall vote on the preferred option using the voting rule in OIML B 18:2018, 11.4.2 or 11.4.3, as appropriate.

If the MC Members approve the preferred option, the BIML shall submit the preferred option to the CIML for approval. If the MC Members do not approve the preferred option, the choice of option and/or the reasons shall be reviewed. If a new preferred option and/or new reasons are identified, this shall be submitted to the MC Members. If a new preferred option and/or new reasons are not identified, or if the new preferred option is not approved by the MC Members, this information shall be fed back to the PC for further consideration.

A.5 Other publications

For other publications, the BIML shall consult with the appropriate TC or SC secretariat on the selection of the preferred periodic review option. Members of the appropriate TC or SC secretariat may also be involved in the consultation.

The preferred option (either 1, 2, 3 or 4 from A.3) for periodic review shall be selected, with the reason(s) for selecting the preferred option identified. The P-Members of the appropriate TC or SC shall vote on the preferred option using the voting rule in OIML B 6-1:2017, 5.12.1 or 5.12.2, as appropriate.

If the appropriate TC or SC approves the preferred option, the BIML shall submit the preferred option to the CIML for approval. If the TC or SC does not approve the preferred option, the choice of option and/or the reasons shall be reviewed. If a new preferred option and/or new reasons are not identified, or if the new preferred option is not approved by the TC or SC, this information shall be fed back to the PC for further consideration.

A.6 CIML decision

The BIML shall report on the outcome of the review to the CIML, which shall make a decision using the voting rule in OIML B 6-1:2017, 6.7.2 or 6.7.3, as appropriate on whether to accept the result of the OIML-CS MC vote or TC/SC vote as appropriate.

A.7 Implementation of CIML decision

A.7.1 Course of action to be followed

If the CIML approves the result of the review, the relevant action in A.7.1.1 to A.7.1.4 shall be taken, depending on whether the publication should be reconfirmed, revised, updated or withdrawn.

If the CIML does not approve the result of the periodic review, an alternative course of action shall be proposed by the CIML.



54 CIML Addendum 10.1.3.2

Version 1 - 2019-07-19

A.7.1.1 Reconfirmed

The BIML shall amend the cover page of the publication and references to it on the OIML website to indicate both the original date of publication and the latest date of reconfirmation, and notify all CIML Members accordingly.

A.7.1.2 Revised

The procedures in OIML B 6-1:2017, 6 shall be applied to develop a new edition of the publication, with all relevant information included in the project proposal which shall be made according to OIML B 6-1, 6.2. The project proposal shall include a clearly defined project plan and a timeline.

As a supplement to the procedures in OIML B 6-1:2017, 6, the PC shall review the project proposal and, if the PC considers that the project proposal contains all of the necessary information, the project proposal shall be submitted to the CIML for approval. If the PC considers that the project proposal does not contain all of the necessary information, the proposer shall be asked to improve it and to resubmit it to PC.

A.7.1.3 Updated

For publications of relevance to the OIML-CS, a Working Group under the responsibility of the OIML-CS MC shall be established to develop an updated version of the publication in accordance with the relevant procedures specified in Clause 7 of OIML-CS Operational Document OD-01. When the MC has approved the updated version, it shall be registered as a Draft publication by the BIML.

For other publications, the BIML shall establish a Project Group to update the publication. Members of the PG shall be drawn from the appropriate TC or SC. A new publication update process shall be applied, which shall be a ‘simplified’ version of the existing procedures detailed in OIML B 6-1:2017, 6. This ‘simplified’ procedure shall allow for voting by the PG on a 1CD, followed directly by a CIML vote if the 1CD is approved. In addition, the timescales for the commenting and voting shall be reduced from three months to two months.

A.7.1.4 Withdrawn

The procedure in OIML B 6-1:2017, 5.15.2 shall be applied.



Annex B: Proposed text for inclusion in B 6-1

6.12 Periodic review

6.12.1 All OIML publications are subject to periodic review. The priority for the periodic review of OIML publications is defined by the Presidential Council and the BIML in consultation with the OIML-CS Management Committee, and approved by the CIML.

High priority publications shall be subject to a periodic review every two years. Other publications shall be subject to a periodic review every five years.

6.12.2 The BIML shall conduct a periodic review of a publication to decide if a publication should be either

- a) re-confirmed in its existing form,
- b) revised,
- c) updated, or
- d) withdrawn.

Note 1: A publication shall be revised when a major modification of the publication is considered necessary to address a significant technical change, e.g. inclusion of a new measurement technique, software requirements, technological innovation, etc.

Note 2: A publication shall be updated when a minor modification of the publication is considered necessary to address editorial or minor technical changes, e.g. the reference to an international standard in a test procedure needs to be updated.

6.12.3 For publications that are of relevance to the OIML-CS, the OIML-CS Executive Secretary shall organise an enquiry amongst members of the OIML-CS MC to develop a proposal for the periodic review, according to one of the options in 6.12.2. The appropriate TC or SC secretariat shall be involved in the enquiry. For other publications, the BIML shall consult with the appropriate TC or SC secretariat to develop a proposal for the periodic review, according to one of the options in 6.12.2.

6.12.4 When a proposal for the periodic review is developed according to 6.12.3, the reason(s) for the selection of one of the options in 6.12.2 shall be included in the proposal.

6.12.5 For publications that are of relevance to the OIML-CS, the OIML-CS Executive Secretary shall submit the proposal to the MC Members for voting in accordance with the voting rules specified in OIML B 18:2018, 11.4.2 or 11.4.3, with a two-month voting deadline.

6.12.6 For other publications, the BIML shall submit the proposal to the appropriate TC or SC, with a three-month voting deadline. The proposal shall be accepted when two-thirds of the votes cast by the P-members of the TC or SC are in favour. Abstentions and failures to reply are not considered as votes cast.

6.12.7 If the proposal is not accepted, the BIML shall inform the OIML-CS MC or the appropriate TC or SC secretariat of the refusal. The BIML shall review the reasons for the refusal with the OIML-CS MC or the appropriate TC or SC secretariat, and an amended proposal shall be considered. If an



54 CIML Addendum 10.1.3.2

Version 1 - 2019-07-19

amended proposal is developed, with an alternative option selected from 6.12.2, the relevant process in 6.12.5 shall be repeated. If an amended proposal is not developed, or if the OIML-CS MC or appropriate TC or SC does not accept the amended proposal, the outcome of the periodic review shall be reported to the Presidential Council for consideration of an alternative course of action.

6.12.8 If a proposal is accepted, the BIML shall report on the outcome of the periodic review to the CIML. The CIML shall make a decision (using the voting rule in 6.7.2 or 6.7.3) on whether to accept the result of the TC/SC vote.

6.12.9 If the CIML approves the result of the periodic review, the following steps shall be taken, depending on whether the publication should be

- a) reconfirmed, in which case the BIML shall amend the cover page of the publication and references to it on the OIML website to indicate both the original date of publication and the latest date of reconfirmation, and notify all CIML Members accordingly, or
- b) revised, in which case the procedures in clause 6 shall be applied to develop a new edition of the publication, or
- c) updated, in which case the BIML shall update the publication, in conjunction with the appropriate TC or SC secretariat, using the publication update process described in 6.13, or
- d) withdrawn, in which case the procedure in 5.15.2 shall be applied.

6.12.10 If the CIML does not approve the result of the periodic review, an alternative course of action shall be proposed by the CIML.

6.13 Publication updates

6.13.1 Where the result of a periodic review is the update of a publication (6.12.8 c)), the following procedure shall be applied.

6.13.1.1 For publications of relevance to the OIML-CS, a Working Group under the responsibility of the OIML-CS MC shall be established to develop an updated version of the publication in accordance with the relevant procedures specified in clause 7 of OIML-CS Operational Document OD-01. When the MC has approved the updated version, it shall be registered as a Draft publication by the BIML.

6.13.1.2 For other publications, the BIML shall establish a Project Group (PG) under the responsibility of the appropriate TC or SC to develop the update. The relevant procedures in clause 6 shall be applied, with the exception that the PG can vote on a first Committee Draft (1CD), a CIML Preliminary Ballot is not required and the voting and commenting period at the 1CD and subsequent stages is two months.

Annex C: Amended periodic review procedure – flowchart for inclusion in OIML B 6-1

The priority for the periodic review of OIML publications is defined by the Presidential Council and the BIML in consultation with the OIML-CS Management Committee, and approved by the CIML. (6.12.1)

